



PRESS RELEASE

Press Release on 'India's bid for NSG Nuclear Supplier Group and decline to High Tech Trade for Pakistan'

NSG deliberations and blitz kreig efforts by the Indian prime minister Narinder Modhi with the NSG member states in Geneva leaves out the facts that 9 Indian entities were recently on US export control entity lists for nuclear technology violations.

This has not stopped the outgoing US administration for building a case for supporting Indian membership in the NSG and a case against Pakistan's efforts.

In the absence of a credible case against Pakistan's nuclear program unverified resources are being used such as social media and intelligence reports to create doubts and apprehensions with regards to steps taken by Pakistan. Pakistan has a well developed export control system and takes its responsibility seriously. However, this has not stopped Project Alpha to use these sources to produce another layer of misperception about Pakistan's nuclear program.

Similarly the use of unverified social media sources to threaten Pakistan with a nuclear attack by allegedly former Israeli defense minister (claimed by the Ministry of Defense of Israel as false).

Highlighting the policy of nuclear apartheid by the outgoing US administration Dr Maria Sultan stated that the possibility of increasing concerns or doubts of the Pakistani entity lists on scrutiny requires a fresh outlook. She was speaking at the Serena Hotel on "nuclear supplier Group (NSG) Indian membership :Decline to High Tech Trade" on December 26th, 2016.

Dr. Sultan, D.G SASSI highlighted that these unverified sources such as social media, commercial websites, intelligence reports, and WikiLeaks form majority of the base for Project Alpha report. The report aims to create apprehensions and doubts through attacking the public perception for Pakistan's program.



The report makes a case against Pakistan's membership to the nsg on the pretext that pakistan is still acquiring technology , without making any reference to the gaps in the Indian export controls.

It can make Pakistan's Nuclear Supplier Group membership case more complicated. This report may also muddle Pakistan's interaction with the upcoming U.S. administration. She said that an academic report based on such sources should not be a criterion for putting companies of the U.S. entity list or raising concerns against Pakistan's nuclear program. The possible inclusion of Pakistani companies in the U.S. entity list, mentioned in the Project Alpha report, will affect Pakistan's defence, nuclear and commercial industry. The Project Alpha report is targeting Pakistan's jugular vein by attacking companies that are its industrial base. Furthermore, the outgoing U.S. administration is also playing its role in making the future of Pakistan-U.S. relations more complicated.

The key assertions made in the presentation were that Pakistan aims to build a cooperative trade connection with the US, Pakistan fulfills the NSG criteria and by broadening the base on entities listed in the sanctions list will hamper the possibility of trade and development in Pakistan. This will also impact on global export controls if there is no criteria based approach. Similarly the non-NPT states will lose out the most if there is no legally binding non-proliferation commitment made by India.

Project Alpha makes an argument that Pakistan should not be given access to the NSG because it is still involved in a discreet acquisition program for nuclear and missile program .However the presentation made at SASSI contested the claim that the case made by Project Alpha lacked substance and balance in approach, as it is was designed to substantiate India -US defense industry collaboration and case for NSG member ship to India, rather than an objective assessment.



Through sustained campaign in informal networks and media a case is being built against Pakistan's defense, nuclear and high-tech industry which is stark contrast to the reality on ground.

The Indo-U.S collaboration unfortunately is not restricted to NSG membership request for India but also includes trade through Defense Trade and Technology Initiative (DTTI). This includes the U.S path finder project; Dr. Sultan said that it contains 4 parts: UAVs production in India, Naval propulsion systems enhancing Indian hegemony in Indian Ocean Region (IOR), Defence agreement F-16 between U.S and India, Jet propulsion system, so this will finally lead to unbreakable defence agreement between U.S and India.

Similarly, the collaboration between India and Israel is also being carried out in air force, army, navy, including intelligence sharing.

The MOSSAD training to RAW to upgrade Indian Defense capabilities is not restricted to intelligence sharing only but will also include co-joint training of Indian forces for surgical strikes as a possible form of joint defense learning .the joint defense collaboration of Indian and Israel has brought the defense and security interests of the two countries to be aligned with each other . This relationship is based on a wide range of collaboration such as EHUD AACMI System for Indian Air Forces, The Overhaul of MiG-21 fighters, Long Range Tracking Radars- (LRTRs), Barak- 8 Long Range Surface to Air Missile- (LR-SAM), IAI cooperation in INFAC T-82 and Super Dvora MKII Boats, The upgradation Ka-25 anti-submarine helicopters, Cooperation in Tech SAR, RISAT-II spy Satellite, Anti-Ballistic Missile Technology

The cooperation in the defense and high-tech trade between India and Israel is approximately \$ 9 billion and this is not restricted to trade but also to counter insurgency techniques.in the case of Kashmir these are the most visible.The use of social media to generate nuclear threats against Pakistan through unverified sources is uncalled for she added.

The Israeli ministry of Defense a specialist in propaganda and social media should have retracted the threat to Pakistan much before a response from Islamabad. This a case of similar example where unverified social media sources are lumped as academic references to create real effect after sometime as seen in the case of project alpha.

Dr. Sultan said that the perceptions which have been created through open source, against the Pakistan's defence and nuclear, high-tech industry is unacceptable. The base of Sanctions being magnified which is based on political reasons and Indo-U.S agreements and Israel Indian defence agreements is yet another complication.

She stated that the containerized global trade which is passing through the Indian Ocean is 17.7% . This volume of trade is to pass through Pakistan benefitting China Pakistan Economic Corridor (CPEC) .

Talking about Indo-US joint agreement, she stated that this will lead India and US to decide collectively in targeting countries under terrorist label. Moreover, 99% U.S access to high tech trade or sensitive technology transfer as admissible to India. In comparison Pakistan is been restricted to 99.8% of U.S defence and high tech trade access under different non tariff and tariff barriers .

While talking about removal of Indian Entities Dr. Sultan said that it is interesting that on consistent perusal of Indian Government, US Commerce Department's Bureau of Industry had removed nine Indian entities from its entity list in 2011 thus easing certain export and re-export restrictions applicable to India. Removed entities were involved in the Indian missile and space program. Moreover, India was promoted to the Department of Commerce's MTCR Countries Group (A:2) , though India joined MTCR later in 2016.

While talking about Indian Entry into NSG, she said that US – India will have a common industry, this defense collaboration could exclude an effective SCO without India as key runner and we could be seeing a regional block sans India . The current bend of the outgoing US administration she argued will



create an Economic triad of US Technology and R&D with the Indian Human Resource that will be counterproductive to the long term and strategic interests of US if they are single country driven.

She said that Pakistan's concern is that granting India a country-specific waiver by NSG in 2008 neither served the cause of nonproliferation, nor the South Asia's strategic stability. Region's strategic stability is a critical factor for achieving the object of non-proliferation. So, NSG's 48 participating governments should adopt a nondiscriminatory approach on the question of NSG membership for non-NPT states rather than the creation of another country-specific exemption.

Dr. Sultan said that Pakistan wants simultaneous entry into the Group with other non-NPT States that aspire to participate in the Group. This would require a fair and simultaneous consideration of the two membership applications submitted by the non-NPT states. Such a fair and unbiased approach would go a long way in making NSG a more effective platform to prevent nuclear proliferation. Pakistan has been engaged with NSG for almost a decade is now ready to formally engage with the Group for presenting our detailed credentials (its export control and management regime, its nuclear supplier capabilities and the history of its engagement with NSG) for participating in NSG.

She concluded that India and U.S are trying to cover up Pakistan's defence as a whole through non-traditional means which will only lead to instability in the whole region